

FACULTY OF PHILOSOPHY

STAFF-STUDENT COMMITTEE MINUTES

A Meeting of Philosophy Staff and Students was held on Tuesday 5 February 2013 at 1.05 p.m. in the Philosophy Faculty Board Room, Sidgwick Site.

Present: Jane Clare (Principal Secretary), Heather Sanderson (Administrator), Jenni Lecky-Thompson (Librarian), Charlie Evans (Secretarial Assistant), Professor Tim Crane (Faculty Chair), Hallvard Lillehammer (Undergraduate Co-ordinator), Prof John Marenbon, Benjamin Phillips, Peter Zhokovsky, Vittoria Fallanca, Mike Hastings, Neal Carrier.

- 1 Starring of items was invited.
- 2 Apologies for absence were received from Huw Price.
- 3 The minutes of the meeting held on 30 October 2012 were approved. It was noted that these minutes were previously circulated to all students via e-mail for information.
- 4 Election of Student Representatives:
It was noted that following on from nominations received by Tuesday 20th November 2012, the following three students have been appointed as Faculty Board Representatives:
Vittoria Fallanca, Part IB — Churchill College
Benjamin Phillips, Part IB — Downing College
Michael Hastings, Graduate (MPhil) — Churchill College

Council representatives – Election of 29 November 2012
It was further noted that all students on the electoral roll were also eligible to stand to be elected as either an undergraduate or a graduate representative to the Council of the School of Arts and Humanities. It was reported that the new representatives for the Council of the School of the Arts and Humanities are:
Undergraduate rep: Claire Elford (Downing College/Architecture)
Graduate rep: Fran Middleton (King's College/Classics)
- 5 New appointments:
It was reported that the Principal Secretary, Mrs Margrit Edwards, retired on December 31st 2012, and has now been replaced by Mrs Jane Clare.

Academic vacancies:
It was noted that the Faculty is currently advertising in order to appoint **either** two Professors **or** two University Lecturers/Senior Lecturers to begin their appointments on 1 September 2013. It was further noted that the deadline for applications is **3pm on Thursday 31 January 2013.**
- 6 Discussion Groups for Part IB students:
Students were informed that the following five discussion groups will be running from weeks 2-7 of Lent Term 2013:
Metaphysics & epistemology, Group 1 – Michael Hannon – Thursday, 3-4pm, LB12
Metaphysics & epistemology, Group 2 – Michael Hannon – Thursday, 1-2pm, Board Rm
Ethics, Group 1 – Chris Cowie - Monday, 3-4pm, LB10
Ethics, Group 2 – Chris Cowie - Friday, 10-11am, LB12
Logic, Group 1 – Lucy Campbell – Tuesdays, 4-5pm, LB10

Logic Group 2 – Lucy Campbell – Wednesdays, 10-11am, RFB Rm 326
Philosophy of Science – Nicholas Teh - Wednesday, 4-5pm, RFB rm 222
Political Philosophy - Sebastian Nye - Friday, 2-3pm, LB12
 Students were reminded that IB discussion group readings and reading lists can be accessed on CamTools.

7 Deadline for handing in Extended Essays/Dissertations

Students were reminded that the deadline for submitting extended essays for Part IB and Part II is **Friday 15th March 2013 at 12 noon**. Students were also reminded that if they miss this deadline without prior approval from the Chair of Examiners, they will be required to instead sit the written exam for this paper (although students should be aware that Friday 15th March is also the deadline for amendments to exam entries. It was further noted that if a student does not submit their extended essays by the deadline, and then does not ask the College to amend their exam entry to sit the written paper, they would then fail that paper).

Students were further reminded that the deadline for submitting dissertations for Part II is **Friday 3rd May 2013 at 12 noon**. It was noted that if students miss this deadline without prior approval from the Chair of Examiners, students will then fail that paper, as by May 3rd, the final deadline would have passed for amending exam entries.

8 Philosophy Examinations in 2013

Students were reminded that from this year, a new numerical marking scheme will be introduced. It was noted that details of the previous marking criteria will remain on the Faculty website at:

http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/u_grads/u_grads_exams.html

It was further noted that details of the new marking guidelines and criteria are now also available on the Faculty website at:

http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/u_grads/u_grads_exams.html

9 Joint degree – Philosophy and Psychology - the new PBST (Psychological and Behavioural Sciences tripos)

It was noted that Professor Crane and Dr J. Russell (Department of Psychology) propose to incorporate philosophy courses within the new PBS tripos. Professor Crane is on the Management Committee.

It was explained that students taking the Philosophy/Psychology track (from October 2013) would take 2 Philosophy papers each year from the following list:

Part IA – Paper 1- Metaphysics and ~~Philosophy of Mind~~, Paper 3 – Logic

Part IB – Paper 1- Metaphysics and Epistemology, Paper 2- Logic

Part II – Paper 1- Metaphysics, Paper 2- Philosophy of Mind, Paper 7- Mathematical Logic, Paper 8- Philosophical Logic

It was noted that it is under consideration that the Part II Phil of Science paper will be added to this list.

It was reported that it had been agreed at Faculty Board on January 28th 2013 that a cap of 4 students would be imposed for each yearly intake for this track in the first instance.

*10 Proposed syllabus changes for Tripos 2013-2014:

It was noted that the syllabus changes listed below were proposed at the Faculty Board meeting held on Monday January 28th 2013, following Caucus meetings:

Part IA Paper 1 - Metaphysics **and philosophy of mind**

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- God: existence of; the problem of evil; miracles.
- Causation **and induction**: ~~regularity; necessitation; determinism and fatalism.~~
- Free will: concepts of freedom; **determinism and fatalism**
- Mind and matter
- Personal identity; **persons and other objects**

~~Knowledge and skepticism; induction~~

Part IA, Paper 2 Ethics and political philosophy

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- Fact and value.
- Objectivity and subjectivity.
- Morality and the self: egoism and altruism; morality, amorality, immorality.
- Forms of consequentialism: act-, rule- and motive-utilitarianism; theories of the good.
- Rights: analyses of rights; natural rights; rights and utility; rights and interests; rights and choice.
- ~~Punishment: desert and retribution; deterrence; communicative theories; reform.~~
- **Political obligation, authority and dissent: what is political obligation?: attempted justifications of political authority; anarchism; civil disobedience and political dissent.**

Part IA Paper 3 Logic

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least eight set, including at least one from each section.

Section A: Formal Logic

- Basic concepts: formalized languages; object-language and metalanguage; use and mention; validity, implication and consistency.
- Truth-functional logic: truth-functions, tautologies, proof; **soundness and completeness.**
- Introduction to first-order logic: the language of quantifiers and variables; validity and counterexamples; the semantics of quantifiers; elements of the logic of identity.
- Classes and relations.
- Elements of probability calculus.

Section B: Philosophical logic

- Problems of translation between natural and formal languages.
- **The theory of Names, variables and descriptions; referential and substitutional readings of the quantifiers**
- Necessity, analyticity and the a priori.
- Meaning, intention and conventions.

Suggestions for change for 2013-14:

- Delete "soundness and completeness" (*move to IB*);
- Change "The theory of descriptions" to "Names, variables and descriptions";
- Add "Referential and substitutional readings of the quantifiers" (*part of a topic from IB Paper 2*).

Part IB Paper 1

Metaphysics and Epistemology

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- ~~Perception: direct and representational theories~~ **Reality: idealism and mind-dependence; Primary and secondary qualities**
- ~~The metaphysics of modality:~~ **possible worlds, modal realism**

- ~~Knowledge, including a priori knowledge; externalist and internalist theories of justification; the possibility and significance of scepticism; transcendental arguments.~~
- Knowledge: externalism and internalism; theories of warrant and justification
- Scepticism: the problem of scepticism and responses
- ~~Theories of the nature of mind: marks of the mental; dualism; behaviourism; mind-brain identity; functionalism; anomalous monism; eliminativism; mechanism and computation~~
- Sources of knowledge: evidence; perception; a priori knowledge; testimony

Part IB Paper 2 Logic

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- Theories of meaning: compositionality of meaning; verificationism.
- Truth: semantic, redundancy, correspondence and coherence theories of truth.
- ~~Quantifiers: the semantics of quantified sentences; referential and substitutional readings~~
- Logical form: the purposes of formalisation; logical form and theories of meaning.
- Names and descriptions: sense and reference; Russell's theory of descriptions; causal theory of names; identity.
- Variants of classical logic: elements of modal logic; intuitionistic logic.
- Theories: the axiomatic method; informal and formal theories; examples.
- **Metatheory of propositional calculus: the method of proof by induction; normal form; expressive adequacy; soundness and completeness.**

Suggestions for change in 2013-14:

- i) Add "Metatheory of propositional calculus: the method of proof by induction; normal form; expressive adequacy; soundness and completeness."
- ii) Delete: "Quantifiers: the semantics of quantified sentences; referential and substitutional readings".

Part IB Paper 5 Modern and medieval philosophy **Early Modern Philosophy**

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ~~fifteen~~ twelve set.

- ~~Abelard Collationes.~~
- ~~Ibn Tufayl Hayy Ibn Yaqzan.~~
- Descartes, Meditations on first philosophy.
- Leibniz, Discourse on Metaphysics and Monadology.
- Locke, Essay Concerning Human Understanding **Books I & II.**
- Berkeley, The Principles of Human Knowledge and Three Dialogues between Hylas and Philonous.
- Hume, A Treatise of Human Nature, Book I and Appendix.

Some comparative questions may be set.

Part IB Paper 7 - Political philosophy

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- ~~Political obligation: social contract theory; alternative justifications of political authority; anarchism.~~ **Power: what is power?; who has power? power, justification and violence.**
- Democracy: justifications of democracy; deliberative democracy; paradox of democracy.
- Equality: Rawls and Nozick; equality of what?; the value of equality; equality and efficiency; equality of opportunity and positive discrimination.
- Liberty: positive and negative liberty; the value of freedom; autonomy and paternalism.

Part II Paper 1 - Metaphysics

Candidates are asked to answer three questions **out of at least ten set.**

~~Candidates also taking Paper 9 may not answer questions in this paper on Wittgenstein's *Tractatus* which will be marked with an asterisk (*). The paper will be set in such a way that there are at least ten questions not marked with an asterisk.~~

- Realism and idealism: varieties of realism; conceptual schemes; **transcendental arguments**
- Particulars, properties, and facts: the contrast of particular and universal, and of abstract and concrete; the constituents and roles of facts; nominalism; conceptualism; realism; tropes
- Persistence and change: objects and events; perdurance and endurance
- Causation: causation and agency; realism about causation, for and against; direction of causation
- Time: tensed and tenseless theories; differences between time and space.
- Persons: their persistence and unity; **their metaphysical status animalism and alternatives**
- ~~*Set text: Wittgenstein, *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*~~

Part II Paper 2 - Philosophy of mind

Candidates are asked to answer three questions **out of at least ten set.**

~~Candidates also taking Paper 9 may not answer questions in this paper on Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*, which will be marked with an asterisk (*). The paper will be set in such a way that there are at least ten questions not marked with an asterisk.~~

- ~~• Knowledge of other minds: the roles of analogy, of theory and of simulation~~
- ~~• First person thought: indexical thought; first person authority~~
- ~~• The nature of consciousness~~
- ~~• Theories of intentionality and mental content: thought and language; object dependence~~
- ~~• Mental causation and physicalism~~
- ~~• **Set text: Wittgenstein, *Philosophical investigations***~~
- **Metaphysics of mind: physicalism and alternatives (dualism, functionalism, anomalous monism, reduction and non-reduction); mental causation**
- **Epistemology of mind: knowledge of one's own mind; knowledge of other minds**
- **Consciousness: varieties of consciousness; intentional theories of consciousness; the explanatory gap**
- **Intentionality and mental representation: the nature of intentionality; the mark of the mental; intentional objects; reductive theories of content; externalism and internalism**
- **Mental faculties: intention and the will; emotion; imagination**

Part II Paper 9

Special subject specified by the Faculty Board

In **2013 2014** Wittgenstein

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

~~Candidates taking this paper are barred from answering asterisked (*) questions in Paper 1, *Metaphysics* and in Paper 2, *Philosophy of mind*.~~

- *Tractatus*
- *Philosophical Investigations*
- *On Certainty*

- Study of the following topics is also included: the development throughout Wittgenstein's work of his views on solipsism and the self, and the nature of philosophy.

Prof Crane gave some background to the changes suggested to the papers coming under the **Metaphysics and Philosophy of Mind caucus** (Part IA, Paper 1, Part IB, Paper 1, and Part II, Papers 1, 2 and 9). He explained that the idea was to move topics around so as to concentrate study of Philosophy of Mind in the third year, the study of Epistemology in the second year, with Metaphysics in all three years (although still incorporating the introductory subject of Mind and Matter in IA). Prof Crane explained that it had also been decided to remove the Wittgenstein set texts from Part II Papers 1 and 2, as it was felt that students with a particular interest in Wittgenstein would normally opt to take paper 9, and the Faculty had noticed that those taking papers 1 and 2 had not answered the questions on the Wittgenstein set texts in the exams for several years. Prof Crane also commented that he hopes that as Wittgenstein has proved to be such a popular specialist subject for Part II Paper 9, it may become a permanent paper at some point in the future. The students present said that they were happy with the changes Prof Crane had outlined.

Dr Hallvard Lillehammer then gave some background to the changes proposed for the papers coming under the **Ethics, Political Philosophy and Aesthetics caucus** (Part IA Paper 2, Part IB, Papers 3 and 7, and Part II, Papers 3, 10 and 11). Dr Lillehammer explained that while the name of Part IA, Paper 2 had been changed to Ethics and Political Philosophy a couple of years ago, the syllabus content had not changed much. Dr Lillehammer explained that it has therefore now been decided to replace the topic of Punishment with that of Political Obligation, which will introduce themes central to political philosophy into the IA paper, and by doing so, give first year students the opportunity to see whether they would like to continue further with studying Political Philosophy in later years. Dr Lillehammer also explained that it was felt that Political Obligation is a topic that would resonate with first year students, as it is a topic that many people new to studying philosophy would already have opinions on. Dr Lillehammer explained moving Political Obligation out of the IB paper then left a hole in the syllabus which it had been decided to fill with the topic of Power, which is a central issue in Political Philosophy, and was felt to fit with the thematic nature of the paper. Neal Carrier questioned how well the topic of Power fitted with the rest of the paper, as it doesn't have such a strong analytical history, whereas there is a more analytical strand through the rest of the current topics in the paper. However, Dr Lillehammer explained that in Part II, Paper 10, there are more themes which could be seen as being more open to attacks on 'tradition', so including the topic of Power at IB would be an good introduction to this. Some students also said that they would be sorry to lose the topic of punishment from IA. However, Dr Lillehammer explained that there would still be scope for punishment to be explored under the topic of consequentialism, and that students might also be able to address the topic of punishment if they choose to do a dissertation for Part II. Dr Lillehammer stressed that the changes proposed for his caucus would be a work in progress, and that it might still be necessary to balance up the topics moving forward. He also explained that care would be taken over the reading list for the amended papers to make sure it would be contemporary enough, and could also be used by supervisors. The students present were happy with this explanation.

It was explained that all the above suggested changes have been approved in principle by the Faculty Board and as the Staff-Student Committee didn't have any strong objections to any of these changes, they will be implemented with effect from October 2013. It was noted that feedback that students had given during the meeting would be discussed at the next Faculty Board meeting on 4 March 2013.

11 Exam scripts now available on the Philosophy website

It was noted that following discussions at the SSC meeting held on 7th February 2012, two sample exam Part IA scripts have been made available on the website, anonymised and with the permission of the authors. It was further noted that the scripts can be found on the following web page:

http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/u_grads/u_grads_sample_answers.html

12 National Student Survey 2013

It was reported that the National Student survey opened on Monday January 14th. It was noted that all part II students should have been emailed a link to this survey, which will run until April. Students were informed that the NSS is an independent survey asking students to rate the quality of their Higher Education experience, and the results of this survey help prospective students, their families and advisors to make study choices. Students were strongly encouraged to take part in this survey.

*13 Part II, paper 5, Philosophy in the Long Middle Ages

(circs) It was noted that a proposed updated syllabus (to be introduced from October 2013) had been circulated at the Faculty Board meeting of January 28th 2013. A corresponding specimen question paper was then circulated at the SSC meeting. It was explained that students had already been consulted about this proposed paper, and that Prof Marenbon was attending the meeting so that students could ask any questions that they might have about his proposals. Benjamin Phillips explained that the student reps had asked for feedback from students about the proposed paper, and had only heard back from two students. There was some question over how many students might take this paper. Both Prof Tim Crane and Prof Marenbon explained that they were aware that this would be a specialist paper that they would not expect a large number of students to take. Nonetheless they felt it would be of interest to some, and that the teaching being proposed may be of interest to graduates, and students from cognate faculties, such as Divinity, whose students might eventually have the possibility of borrowing this paper. Prof Marenbon also explained that as this paper would cover the period up to the 1700's, this might appeal to students who might not have been interested in studying the medieval period covered by the current IB paper. Students also questioned whether this paper would be broad enough, as it essentially just covers two themes. Prof Marenbon explained that these are two wide themes – the chronological breadth covered is large, as are the proposed geographical and cultural areas which the paper would cover, and he also explained that he would plan to vary these themes over time. Prof Marenbon said that he hoped that the paper would be seen as approachable by those students who had an interest in this area. Students at the meeting also pointed out that the specimen exam paper showed that students would be required to answer at least one commentary style question, which do not feature on any other current Philosophy exam papers. Prof Marenbon acknowledged this, but pointed out that students would be taught how to tackle this style of question, and would therefore have the chance to learn useful skills in tackling historical works. Prof Crane concluded the discussion by thanking Prof Marenbon for all the work he has done on this new paper proposal, and said that he feels it will offer students the chance to take a distinctive and novel paper. Students were assured that the level of difficulty would be comparable to other papers at Part II.

14 Part II, paper 6, Philosophy of Science

It was reported that at the SSC meeting of October 30th 2012, Dr Ahmed asked for student feedback on the proposed syllabus and special subject for this paper (to be re-introduced from October 2013). The proposed syllabus is shown below:

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- Philosophy of Physics I: the metaphysics of space and space-time; geometry and conventionalism absolute and relational theories of space; space and space-time.
- Philosophy of Physics II: the interpretation of quantum mechanics; non-locality.
- Philosophy of Biology: biological kinds, the nature of species; biological laws; functional and causal explanation in biology.

- Philosophy of Social Science: social science versus natural science; rational choice theory and social science; social ontology.
- **Special Annual** topic (2013-14): Explanation: pragmatics of explanation; unificatory explanation; **functional explanation**; statistical explanation."

15 Graduate Questionnaires

It was reported that all 25 MPhil students returned completed questionnaires. 10 students gave the course the maximum score of 5, 13 gave it 4 and 2 gave it 3. Nearly all (22) students were happy that their supervisors read their work and made useful written comments. It was noted that practically all this year's students had attended the Moral Sciences Club during Michaelmas, as well as an impressive cross-section of other seminars in line with their interests, with the Political Philosophy Workshop and the Serious Metaphysics Group proving to be particularly popular. It was further noted that the general consensus was that graduate seminars are useful. All but one student were happy with the availability of books and journals.

It was reported that Michael Hastings (MPhil student rep) said at the Faculty Board meeting that took place on Monday January 28th 2013 that special notice should be taken of two points – that some students felt that senior members of the Moral Sciences Club react dismissively to questions from MPhil students, and that one student was unhappy with the amount of supervisions they were getting – in this example only 2 in one term. It was noted that Prof Price said he would look into these matters.

16 Lecture Questionnaires:

Students were reminded that questionnaires will be distributed again at the end of all lecture series' in Lent Term 2013, as well as used to assess Logic Classes and Discussion Groups. Students were also reminded that if they would like to give feedback, but miss the session when questionnaires are handed out, questionnaires can also be downloaded from the Faculty website at: http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/u_grads/questionnaires/ugrad_questionnaires.html

17 Lecture Evaluation Sheets:

It was noted that summary Evaluation sheets for Lectures, Discussion Groups and Logic Classes held in Michaelmas Term 2012 are now available for consultation at the Library Issue Desk.

18 Heating in the Graduate Centre

It was noted that several requests have been made, via the suggestion box, for there to be more constant heating in the Graduate Centre over the weekend. Heather Sanderson has now arranged with Estate Management for heating to be left on over the weekends, and up until 8pm on weekdays.

19 Library Committee meeting:

It was noted that the date for the meeting this year will be Monday 11 February at 1.05pm in the Philosophy Faculty Board Room.

20 Library Questionnaire

It was reported that the annual library questionnaire will run between 28 January and 8 February. Students were encouraged to complete one to provide valuable feedback about the library and its services. Students were informed that if they complete the questionnaire and leave their email ID, they would be entered into a prize draw with a chance to **win £25 Amazon vouchers**.

21 Careers Service:

Careers Service Presentation – Friday 25th January 2013, 12pm-1pm

It was reported that Mr David Ainscough from the Careers Service held a lecture for mainly 2nd year Philosophy students with information specifically tailored to

Philosophy students. It was noted that this event was held to ensure 2nd year students are actively engaged in their career process. It was noted that after the lecture Mr Ainscough gave one-to-one guidance interviews to those who wished it here in the Faculty. Following the success of this session, it was reported that Mr Ainscough will now be running a two hour session for Part IA students on Thursday 7th February from 2-4pm. It was noted that Mr Ainscough will contact students directly with more information about this event.

22 Cambridge Open Days:

It was noted that the Cambridge Open Days for prospective undergraduate students will be on Thursday 4 and Friday 5 July 2013.

23 Event reminder:

The 7th Routledge Lecture

It was noted that Professor Susan Wolf, University of North Carolina, College of Arts & Sciences, Chapel Hill, will give the 7th Routledge Lecture on 21st February 2013, 5.30pm in the Little Hall on the Sidgwick site. The title is confirmed as 'Responsibility, Moral and Otherwise'.

24 Any other business.

Coffee machine in the Graduate Common Room:

Heather Sanderson reported that the coffee machine in the graduate common room is currently out of order. She explained that the Faculty were considering replacing the coffee machine with a water cooler (which would also provide hot water) as takings showed that the coffee machine in the graduate common room is not heavily used. Mrs Sanderson had put a notice up in the common room asking students to get in touch with any feedback on this proposal, but had not heard back from any students. Neal Carrier said he thought that it would be very sensible to replace the coffee machine with a water cooler. Mrs Sanderson said that this would be done shortly.

Lighting sensor in the Graduate Centre and other improvements

Mike Hastings asked Mrs Sanderson if anything had been done to increase the time lapse on the light sensor in the graduate centre, so that students would not need to get up and move around so regularly to make the lights come back on. Mrs Sanderson explained that lighting sensors had originally been installed in the Faculty as a way of keeping down energy consumption (the University gives the Faculty a target to stick to, and if the Faculty use too much energy, they are fined). Mrs Sanderson explained that it would be possible to adjust the sensor to alleviate the problem, and that it was hoped that this would be done soon. She also reported that during the Easter vacation, some other work is also scheduled to be carried out (blinds will be fitted in the Graduate Common Room, and in the Board Room, where a permanent date projector will also be installed. This is to make it easier to give presentations in both rooms).

The meeting ended at 13.45 hrs.