STAFF-STUDENT COMMITTEE

Minutes

A meeting of the Philosophy Staff and Student Committee was held on Tuesday 4th February 2014 at 1.05 p.m. in the Philosophy Faculty Board Room

Present: Jane Clare (Principal Secretary), Heather Sanderson (Administrator), Jenni Lecky-Thompson (Librarian), Jackie Goodall (Secretarial Assistant), Professor Tim Crane (Faculty Chair), Prof Rae Langton (MPhil Course Director), Prof Alex Oliver (Undergraduate Co-ordinator), Adam Lalak, Peter Zhukovsky (Chairing the meeting), Liam Livesley, Sophia Cruwell, Emily Platten, Matthew Dougherty, Magdalena Smith, Clare Benn, Matthew Van Der Merwe.

1 Starring of items was invited.

2 Apologies were received from Professor Huw Price.

3 The minutes of the meeting held on 5 November 2013 were approved. These minutes were previously circulated to all students via e-mail for information.

4 Election of Student Representatives

It was noted that following the elections which took place on Tuesday 26th November 2013, the following three students have been appointed as Faculty Board Representatives:

- **Matthew Van Der Merwe** (Part IB) — Gonville & Caius College
- **Peter Zhukovsky** (Part IB) — Churchill College
- **Shyane Siriwardena** (PhD) — Newnham College

Council representatives – Students elected to the Council of the School of Arts and Humanities 2013

All students on the electoral roll were also eligible to stand to be elected as either an undergraduate or a graduate representative to the Council of the School of Arts and Humanities. It was noted that the new representatives for the Council of the School of the Arts and Humanities are:

Undergraduate rep: William Kennaway (PET)
Graduate rep: Alice Corr (M)

5 New appointments

The Committee noted the following new appointments:

1. Jackie Goodall (jkg32) is now providing maternity cover for Charlie Evans in the Faculty Office. Jackie will be working on Tuesdays, Wednesdays and Thursdays.

2. Dr Caterina Tarlazzi – has joined the Faculty as a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellow for 3 years. Her email address is ct365@cam.ac.uk. Her research project is "Logic in the 12th century: a manuscript-based approach”. Prof John Marenbon is her mentor.

3. Dr Michael Blome-Tillmann - EC Marie-Curie Research Fellow for 3 years, here in the Faculty. His email address is mb938@cam.ac.uk. His research project is "Epistemic Vocabulary - Context-sensitivity and the semantics of epistemic vocabulary in natural languages". Tim Crane is the "Scientist in Charge".

4. Prof Boudewijn de Bruin (from University of Groningen) is visiting the Faculty this term. He is working with Prof Alex Oliver on the "Trusting Banks" collaborative research project that is sponsored by the Netherlands Organisation for Science Research.
5. Prof Caspar Hare (from MIT) is visiting the Faculty during Lent and Easter terms.

6. **Academic vacancy**
   It was noted that the Faculty is currently seeking to appoint a University Lecturer in Philosophy who will take up their appointment from 1st September 2014. The Faculty received 221 applications (48 female, 173 male) and is hoping to appoint to the position at the beginning of March.

7. **Discussion Groups for Part IB students**
   It was noted that the following seven discussion groups will be running from weeks 2-7 of Lent Term 2014:
   - **Metaphysics & epistemology** – Ali Boyle – Monday, 10-11am, Mill Lane Rm 11
   - **Ethics Group** – Neal Carrier - Tuesday, 12-1pm, Philosophy Faculty Board Rm
   - **Philosophical Logic Group** – Kyle Mitchell – Mondays, 11am-12pm, Mill Lane Rm 11
   - **Logic Class for Formal Logic** – Prof Michael Potter – Tuesdays, 3-4pm, Mill Lane Rm 10
   - **Early Modern Philosophy** – Alexis Papazoglou– Tuesdays, 2-3pm, RFB Rm 326
   - **Philosophy of Science** – Paul Raekstad - Mondays 3-4pm, Mill Lane 10
   - **Political Philosophy** – Paul Raekstad - Thursdays 3-4pm, Mill Lane 10

   IB discussion group readings and reading lists can be accessed on CamTools.

8. **Deadline for handing in Extended Essays/Dissertations**
   Students were reminded that the deadline for submitting extended essays for Part IB and Part II is **Friday 14th March at 12 noon**. If students miss this deadline without prior approval from the Chair of Examiners, they will be required to instead sit the written exam for this paper (although students should be aware that Friday 14th March is also the deadline for amendments to exam entries. If a student does not submit their extended essays by the deadline, and then does not ask the College to amend their exam entry to sit the written paper, they would then fail that paper).

   Students were further reminded that the deadline for submitting dissertations for Part II is **Friday 2nd May at 12 noon**. If students miss this deadline without prior approval from the Chair of Examiners, students will then fail that paper, as by May 2nd, the final deadline would have passed for amending exam entries.

9. **Philosophy Examinations in 2014**
   Students were reminded that the Philosophy Faculty now uses a numerical marking scheme.

   Details of the current marking guidelines and criteria are now also available on the Faculty website at:
   [http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/curr-students/IA/curr-students/ugrads-exam-folder/ugrads-exams/markings-criteria-new](http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/curr-students/IA/curr-students/ugrads-exam-folder/ugrads-exams/markings-criteria-new)

10. **Proposed syllabus changes for Tripos 2014-2015**
   The Committee noted the syllabus changes listed below, proposed at the Faculty Board meeting held on Monday January 27th 2014, following Caucus meetings:

   1) **Part II Paper 1 Metaphysics**
      Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

      - Realism and idealism: varieties of realism; conceptual schemes: transcendental arguments.
• Particulars, properties, and facts: the contrast of particular and universal, and of abstract and concrete; the constituents and roles of facts; nominalism; conceptualism; realism; tropes.

• Persistence and change; objects and events; perdurance and endurance.

• Causation: causation and agency; realism about causation, for and against; direction of causation.

• Time: tensed and tenseless theories; differences between time and space.

• Persons: their persistence and unity; animalism and alternatives.

Suggested changes for 2014-15:
Delete “and facts” and “the constituents and roles of facts”. Replace semicolons by commas after the words “nominalism, conceptualism, realism,”. Combine the “persistence” and “time” bullet points, and update the “time” wording as below. Replace “Persistence and change; objects and events; perdurance and endurance” and “Time: tensed and tenseless theories; differences between time and space” by the combined bullet point: “Time: Dynamic versus block conceptions; the direction of time; the existence and persistence of entities in time.”

The revised syllabus would then read as follows:
“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

• Realism and idealism: varieties of realism; conceptual schemes: transcendental arguments.

• Particulars, and properties, and facts: the contrast of particular and universal, and of abstract and concrete; the constituents and roles of facts; nominalism; conceptualism; realism; tropes.

• Persistence and change; objects and events; perdurance and endurance.

• Causation: causation and agency; realism about causation, for and against; direction of causation.

• Time: dynamic versus block conceptions; the direction of time; the existence and persistence of entities in time.

• Persons: their persistence and unity; animalism and alternatives.”

2) Part II Paper 2 Philosophy of mind
“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

• Metaphysics of mind: physicalism and alternatives (dualism, functionalism, anomalous monism, reduction and non-reduction); mental causation
• Epistemology of mind: knowledge of one’s own mind; knowledge of other minds
• Consciousness: varieties of consciousness; intentional theories of consciousness; the explanatory gap
• Intentionality and mental representation: the nature of intentionality; the mark of the mental; intentional objects; reductive theories of content; externalism and internalism
• Mental faculties: intention and the will; emotion; imagination"
• Locke, *Essay Concerning Human Understanding Books I & II*.

• Berkeley, *The Principles of Human Knowledge and Three Dialogues between Hylas and Philonous*.


  Some comparative questions may be set."

**Suggestion for change for 2014-15:** Add Leibniz’s *New Essays on Human Understanding*. The revised syllabus would then read as follows:

“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least twelve set.

• Descartes, *Meditations on first philosophy*.

• Leibniz, *Discourse on Metaphysics and Monadology* and *New Essays on Human Understanding*.

• Locke, *Essay Concerning Human Understanding Books I & II*.

• Berkeley, *The Principles of Human Knowledge and Three Dialogues between Hylas and Philonous*.


  Some comparative questions may be set."

3) **Part II Paper 4 European Philosophy from Kant**

“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

• Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason* to the end of the Transcendental Dialectic (A704, B732).

• Hegel, *The Phenomenology of Spirit*, Introduction, Consciousness, Self-consciousness (paragraphs 73-230); *Hegel’s Logic*: being part of the *Encyclopaedia of the Philosophical Sciences*, paragraphs 1-111; *Introduction to Lectures on the Philosophy of History*, as far as (but not including) *The Geographical Basis of World History*.

• Nietzsche, *On the Genealogy of Morality*, *The Birth of Tragedy*, *Beyond Good and Evil*.”

**Suggestions for change in 2014-15:** Amend title of paper to ‘Philosophy of Kant’. Replace Hegel and Nietzsche texts by Kant’s *Critique of Judgement* (his third critique) and Kant’s *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*. The revised syllabus would then read:

“Part II Paper 4 European philosophy from Kant Philosophy of Kant

Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

• Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason* to the end of the Transcendental Dialectic (A704, B732).

• Kant, *Critique of Judgement*
- Kant, *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*

- Hegel, *The Phenomenology of Spirit*. Introduction, Consciousness, Self-consciousness (paragraphs 73-230); Hegel’s Logic: being part of the *Encyclopaedia of the Philosophical Sciences*, paragraphs 1-11; *Introduction to Lectures on the Philosophy of History*, as far as (but not including) *The Geographical Basis of World History*.

- Nietzsche, *On the Genealogy of Morality, The Birth of Tragedy, Beyond Good and Evil."

Other actions: This is a reminder that questions set for Philosophy Part II Paper 4 on Kant should not overlap with questions on Kant for the Paper C11, Metaphysics. Lecturer(s) will need to liaise with Divinity when setting questions.

4) Part II Paper 5 *Philosophy in the Long Middle Ages*

“This paper covers philosophy in the period from c. 400 to c. 1700, in the Latin, Arabic and Hebrew traditions. All texts are studied in translation. For 2013-14, the two set themes will be (a) Universals and (b) Mind and Body. The examination will consist of fifteen questions on the set texts below. Of these, two will be commentary questions, one on an extract from each of the two asterisked texts under Theme 1, the other one on extract from each of the two asterisked texts under Theme 2. Candidates must answer three questions, including one or both of the commentary questions. They may answer essay questions using texts on which they have commented in a commentary question, so long as any substantial repetition of material is avoided.

**Theme 1: Universals**

1. Boethius on universals from second commentary on Porphyry’s *Isagoge*  
2. Abelard *Logica Ingredientibus* (7.25-32.12)  
4. Duns Scotus *Ordinatio* II, d. 3, part I, qq. 1-6  
5. William of Ockham *Ordinatio* I, d.2, qq. 4-8  

**Theme 2: Mind and Body**

2. Thomas Aquinas *De unitate intellectus contra Averroistas*, transl. and commentary by R. McInerny, West Lafayette, Ind., 1993  
5. Descartes *Meditatio VI* with the objections relevant to it and Descartes’s replies to them  
6. Spinoza *Ethica*, Book II"
The proposed syllabus revisions for 2014-15 were sent by John Marenbon, with the explanatory note about the proposed texts shown in the Appendix:

Replace “Mind and Body” topic by “Scientific Truth and Revelation” and set the texts below. (It is intended that the Scientific Truth and Revelation topic would be available in 2014-15 and 2015-16):

1. Averroes *Decisive Treatise*
3. Boethius of Dacia *On the Eternity of the World*
4. Duns Scotus *Ordinatio*, Prologue, part 1, qu. unica [abridged]
5. Pietro Pomponazzi *On the Immortality of the Soul*
6. Spinoza *Tractatus Theologico-Politicus*

The revised syllabus would then read:

“This paper covers philosophy in the period from c. 400 to c. 1700, in the Latin, Arabic and Hebrew traditions. All texts are studied in translation. For 2013-14 2014-15, the two set themes will be (a) Universals and (b) Mind and Body Scientific Truth and Revelation. The examination will consist of fifteen questions on the set texts below. Of these, two will be commentary questions, one on an extract from each of the two asterisked texts under Theme 1, the other one on extract from each of the two asterisked texts under Theme 2. Candidates must answer three questions, including one or both of the commentary questions. They may answer essay questions using texts on which they have commented in a commentary question, so long as any substantial repetition of material is avoided.

**Theme 1: Universals**

1. Boethius on universals from second commentary on Porphyry’s *Isagoge*
2. Abelard *Logica Ingredientibus* (7.25-32.12)
4. Duns Scotus *Ordinatio* II, d. 3, part I, qq. 1-6
5. William of Ockham *Ordinatio* I, d.2, qq. 4-8
(1,2, 4 and 5 as contained in: *Five Texts on the Medieval Problem of Universals*, transl. P. V. Spade, Indianapolis, 1994)

**Theme 2: Mind and Body Scientific Truth and Revelation**

1. Averroes *Decisive Treatise*
3. Boethius of Dacia *On the Eternity of the World*
4. Duns Scotus *Ordinatio*, Prologue, part 1, qu. unica [abridged]
5. Pietro Pomponazzi *On the Immortality of the Soul*
6. Spinoza *Tractatus Theologico-Politicus*

2. Thomas Aquinas *De unitate intellectus contra Averroistas*, transl. and commentary by R. McInerny, West Lafayette, Ind., 1993
5. Descartes *Meditatio* VI with the objections relevant to it and Descartes’s replies to them

“6. Spinoza *Ethica, Book II*”

**Ethics, Political Philosophy & Aesthetics caucus**

Note The proposed Ethics syllabus revisions in section 3 have been worked on together following the caucus meeting. These have been produced by Paulina Sliwa, Chris Cowie, Richard Holton and Rae Langton.

1) Part IB Paper 7 Political Philosophy

“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- Power: what is power?; who has power? Power, justification and violence.
- Democracy: justifications of democracy; deliberative democracy; paradox of democracy.
- Equality: Rawls and Nozick; equality of what?; the value of equality; equality and efficiency; equality of opportunity and positive discrimination.
- Liberty: positive and negative liberty; the value of freedom; autonomy and paternalism.

Suggestion for change for 2014-15: delete “Rawls and Nozick”. The revised syllabus would then read:

“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- Power: what is power?; who has power? Power, justification and violence.
- Democracy: justifications of democracy; deliberative democracy; paradox of democracy.
- Equality: Rawls and Nozick; equality of what?; the value of equality; equality and efficiency; equality of opportunity and positive discrimination.
- Liberty: positive and negative liberty; the value of freedom; autonomy and paternalism.

2) Part II Paper 11 Aesthetics

“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- Aesthetics: aesthetic experience; realism and anti-realism; imagination and originality; art and morality.
- Art criticism: the nature of art; understanding, interpretation and criticism; representation, expression.
Set texts:

*Suggested changes for for 2014-15:* Add “ontology of art” to “the nature of art”. The revised syllabus would read:

“Candidates are asked to answer three questions out of at least ten set.

- Aesthetics: aesthetic experience; realism and anti-realism; imagination and originality; art and morality.
- Art criticism: the nature of art and ontology of art; understanding, interpretation and criticism; representation, expression.
- Set texts:

3) Proposal for revision of Part IA, Part IB, and Part II Ethics Papers
Since most of those involved in teaching ethics are new, this is a good time to review the Ethics syllabi. One thing that struck us was that the ethics syllabi were heavy on metaethics as compared to normative ethics and moral psychology. The proposed changes aim to strike a better balance between the three areas.

Another motivation has been coherence: For better coherence within papers, we have eliminated some “loose ends” (like the “Universalization, Impartiality, Generality” and the “Moral Relativism” section in IB). Across papers, the aim was to ensure that there is a progression towards more difficult topics.

Finally, we have taken into account the teaching interests and resources of the present members of the Faculty.

The current IA Paper 2 Ethics and Political Philosophy syllabus is:

- Fact and value.
- Objectivity and subjectivity.
- Morality and the self: egoism and altruism; morality, amorality, immorality.
- Forms of consequentialism: act-, rule- and motive-utilitarianism; theories of the good.
- Rights: analyses of rights; natural rights; rights and utility; rights and interests; rights and choice.
- Political obligation, authority and dissent: what is (the problem of) political obligation?; attempted justifications of political authority; anarchism; civil disobedience and political dissent.

We propose instead:
- Introduction to Metaethics: Fact and Value, Objectivity and Subjectivity
- Consequentialism, Deontology, Virtue Ethics
- Egoism and Altruism
- Political obligation, authority and dissent: what is (the problem of) political obligation?; attempted justifications of political authority; anarchism; civil disobedience and political dissent.
The current IB Paper 3 Ethics syllabus is:
• Responsibility and voluntariness.
• Morality, action and consequence; intention and foresight; acts and omissions.
• Reasons for action: Hume on reason, sentiment and passion; internal and external reasons.
• Universalization, impartiality and generality.
• Moral relativism.
• Life and death issues: suicide; euthanasia.

We propose instead:
• Helping & Harming
• Promising
• Internal/External Reasons
• Kantian Constructivism
• Moral Psychology: Moral Motivation, Virtues, Vices, Moral Learning

The current II Paper 3 Ethics syllabus is:
• The ends of action: needs and interests; preference and value; prudence and time preference; well-being.
• Metaethics: realism; expressivism and quasi-realism; irrealism.
• Biomedical ethics: prenatal screening and abortion; genetic engineering and eugenics; health and healthcare.
• Ethics and organisations: corporate agency; corporate responsibility; trust and accountability.
• Set text: Kant, Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals, with special reference to the following topics: the categorical imperative; duty and motive; morality and freedom.

We propose instead:
• Theories of the Good: Intrinsic versus Extrinsic Goodness, Fitting Attitudes,
• Incommensurability
• Well-Being
• Metaethics: realism; expressivism and quasi-realism; irrealism.
• Kant’s Ethics and Kantian Ethics
• Ethics of Knowing: Trust, Stereotype

It was noted that any feedback from the Staff-Student Committee will be discussed at the next Faculty Board meeting on 10th March 2014.

Dr Sliwa explained the reasons behind the changes to the Ethics papers. It was felt that the syllabus was currently too heavy on metaethics and that more overall coherence was needed. The Faculty must offer courses that align with its current teaching strengths and availability. Peter Zhukovsky told the Committee that some students had been in touch with him expressing unhappiness about the apparent lack of applied ethics. Dr Sliwa explained that in the proposed syllabus applied ethics would be spread more evenly over the whole 3 year course, rather than just in Part IA. Mr Zhukovsky agreed that this would make for more cohesion and he thought the students would understand the reasoning behind it. Professor Crane reassured students that there was still scope to write extensively on metaethics, e.g. in the form of an extended essay or dissertation, and also, the possibility of two exam questions on the subject. Dr Sliwa and Professor Langton said that the proposed syllabus had been substantially updated and included many more contemporary theories and
discussions than the old syllabus. Overall, the students present at the meeting 
agreed that the proposed new ethics syllabus was a good thing.

It was agreed that the changes to Part IA, Paper 4 would be postponed until 2015-
2016, after the end of Dr Angela Breitenbach’s research leave, and that changes to 
Part II, Paper 4 should also be deferred. Adam Lalak suggested that the removal of 
courses on Nietzsche and Hegel would make that paper less popular. Professor 
Crane said that unfortunately there are currently no teaching staff who could take on 
those courses.

Emily Platten asked if the reading lists for the IB papers could be more specific. She 
suggested that the IA Set Text reading list could be used as a model. Professor 
Crane said this would be looked into.

There were no further comments on any of the proposed syllabus changes. Peter 
Zhukovsky felt that the discussion had clarified quite a few points that students had 
been concerned about.

11 Exam scripts now available on the Philosophy website
Students were reminded that past exam scripts and sample answers (currently for IA 
only) are available on the website.

12 National Student Survey 2014
It was noted that the National Student survey opened on Monday January 13th. All 
part II students should have been emailed a link to this survey, which will run until 
April. The NSS is an independent survey asking students to rate the quality of their 
Higher Education experience, and the results of this survey help prospective 
students, their families and advisors to make study choices. Students are strongly 
encouraged to take part in this survey.

13 Feedback/Centralised evaluation for Graduate Students
Claire Benn asked the Committee whether the Faculty could set up a facility whereby 
Graduate students applying for academic posts could access all their evaluation 
forms from any discussion groups/logic classes/lectures in one place. Also, would the 
Faculty be able to put together a questionnaire which graduates who supervise could 
ask their undergraduate students to complete? Claire has created her own form for 
the time being (as she needed to get feedback on my teaching and testimonials and 
things for jobs). She has already shared the following link to the form with other 
Graduate students:

https://docs.google.com/forms/d/1iAvgLPYt9b6Urr9nixMRYHkGc0qCoccFP1lttM1PKy 
Q/viewform

Professor Crane and Mrs Sanderson told the Committee that the Faculty would be 
trailing on-line questionnaires again using a new system, Qualtrics. It was a 
possibility that this system could be used to collect feedback for grad students. There 
would be further discussion at the next Faculty Board meeting and the results would 
be reported back to the Staff-Student Committee. Peter Zhukovsky said that the 
Qualtrics system was used in Psychology and had proved effective.

14 Graduate Questionnaires
The Committee noted that the results of the MPhil questionnaire for Michaelmas Term 
2013 were available to current graduate students and that they should email Jane 
Clare (jc478@cam.ac.uk) first if they wish to see them.

15 Lecture Questionnaires
Students were reminded that questionnaires will be distributed again at the end of all lecture series’ in Lent Term 2014, as well as used to assess Logic Classes and Discussion Groups. If students would like to give feedback, but miss the session when questionnaires are handed out, questionnaires can also be downloaded from the Faculty website at: [http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/curr-students/questionnaires/ugrad-questionnaires](http://www.phil.cam.ac.uk/curr-students/questionnaires/ugrad-questionnaires)

16 Lecture Evaluation Sheets
It was noted that summary Evaluation sheets for Lectures, Discussion Groups and Logic Classes held in Michaelmas Term 2013 will shortly be available for consultation at the Library Issue Desk.

17 Library Committee meeting
It was noted that the date for the meeting this year as Monday 18th February at 1:05pm in the Philosophy Faculty Boardroom.

18 Library Questionnaire
It was noted that the annual library questionnaire will run between 27 January and 7 February. Students are encouraged to complete one to provide valuable feedback about the library and its services. Students who complete the questionnaire and leave their email ID you will be entered into a prize draw with a chance to win £25 Amazon vouchers.

19 Cambridge Open Days
The Committee noted that the Cambridge Open Days for prospective undergraduate students will be held on Thursday 3 and Friday 4 July 2014.

20 Undergraduate Social Committee
It was noted that Liam Livesley had communicated with the undergraduates to find out if anyone was willing to run the committee. Unfortunately no students came forward.

21 Student Advice Service
The Committee noted details of the Student Advice Service, which is a free, confidential and independent service jointly offered by the CUSU and the Graduate Union. They have recently launched Advice Drop-In Sessions where students can drop in without an appointment. These sessions take place on Tuesdays and Thursdays from 12pm – 2pm at the Graduate Union, 17 Mill Lane. Further information can be obtained from the website [www.studentadvice.cam.ac.uk](http://www.studentadvice.cam.ac.uk).

22 Event reminder
The 8th Routledge Lecture
It was noted that the Faculty Board has agreed to ask Professor Michael Bratman, Stanford University, to give the Routledge Lecture as he will be in the UK in June.

23 Any other business
Mrs Sanderson gave the meeting some brief details of the Faculty’s application for a Gender Equality Chartermark (GEM). The Faculty is planning to submit an application under the initial pilot scheme. Draft documents and action points are being discussed by the Faculty Board.