

Abstract: Inner and outer harmony

Inferentialism is, on the face of it, an attractive *internalist* theory of meaning. Inferentialists contend that the meaning of an expression is given by its introduction- and elimination-rules, which must be *harmonious*. We focus on the case of identity and ask whether it can be given harmonious formulation. We devise a new notion of harmony — *outer* harmony — which is the best understanding the inferentialist can use to provide identity with harmonious formulation. We argue that this notion of harmony fails, however, because it still lets through plainly unharmonious expressions. Identity therefore cannot be given harmonious formulation — a significant problem, we claim, for inferentialists.